

# In the United States Court of Federal Claims

## OFFICE OF SPECIAL MASTERS

No. 14-1187V

Filed: December 5, 2022

UNPUBLISHED

ROBERT MADIGAN,

Petitioner,

v.

SECRETARY OF HEALTH AND  
HUMAN SERVICES,

Respondent.

Joint Stipulation on Damages;  
Influenza (“flu”) vaccine; Sudden  
Sensorineural Hearing Loss  
(“SSNHL”)

*Andrew D. Downing, Downing, Allison & Jorgenson, Phoenix, AZ, for petitioner.  
Christine Mary Becer, U.S. Department of Justice, Washington, DC, for respondent.*

### **DECISION ON JOINT STIPULATION**<sup>1</sup>

On December 10, 2014, petitioner filed a petition for compensation under the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program, 42 U.S.C. §300aa-10, *et seq.*,<sup>2</sup> (the “Vaccine Act”). Petitioner alleges that the influenza vaccine that he received on December 9, 2011, caused him to suffer unilateral sudden sensorineural hearing loss (“SSNHL”) in his left ear. (Petition at 1; Stipulation, filed December 5, 2022, at ¶ 1). Petitioner further alleges that he has experienced the residual effects of his condition for more than six months, that there has been no prior award or settlement of a civil action for damages as a result of his condition, and that his vaccine was administered in the United States. (Petition at 6; Stipulation at ¶¶ 3-5.) On June 25, 2021, a ruling on entitlement was issued, finding petitioner entitled to compensation for SSNHL. (ECF No. 126.) “Respondent continues to maintain his contrary position, but will not seek review of the Special Master’s determination upon its memorialization as a reviewable decision.” (Stipulation at ¶ 6.)

<sup>1</sup> Because this decision contains a reasoned explanation for the special master’s action in this case, it will be posted on the United States Court of Federal Claims’ website in accordance with the E-Government Act of 2002. See 44 U.S.C. § 3501 note (2012) (Federal Management and Promotion of Electronic Government Services). **This means the decision will be available to anyone with access to the Internet.** In accordance with Vaccine Rule 18(b), petitioner has 14 days to identify and move to redact medical or other information the disclosure of which would constitute an unwarranted invasion of privacy. If the special master, upon review, agrees that the identified material fits within this definition, it will be redacted from public access.

<sup>2</sup> National Childhood Vaccine Injury Act of 1986, Pub. L. No. 99-660, 100 Stat. 3755. Hereinafter, for ease of citation, all “§” references to the Vaccine Act will be to the pertinent subparagraph of 42 U.S.C. § 300aa (2012).

On December 5, 2022, the parties filed the attached joint stipulation, stating that a decision should be entered awarding compensation. I find the stipulation reasonable and adopt it as the decision of the Court in awarding damages, on the terms set forth therein.

Pursuant to the terms stated in the attached Stipulation, **I award the following compensation:**

**A lump sum of \$635,545.39 in the form of a check payable to petitioner.**  
(Stipulation at ¶ 7.) This amount represents compensation for all items of damages that would be available under § 15(a). *Id.*

In the absence of a motion for review filed pursuant to RCFC Appendix B, the clerk of the court is directed to enter judgment in accordance with this decision.<sup>3</sup>

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

**s/Daniel T. Horner**  
Daniel T. Horner  
Special Master

---

<sup>3</sup> Pursuant to Vaccine Rule 11(a), entry of judgment can be expedited by the parties' joint filing of notice renouncing the right to seek review.

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF FEDERAL CLAIMS  
OFFICE OF SPECIAL MASTERS**

ROBERT MADIGAN,

Petitioner,

v.

SECRETARY OF HEALTH  
AND HUMAN SERVICES,

Respondent.

No. 14-1187V  
Special Master Horner  
ECF

**STIPULATION**

The parties hereby stipulate to the following matters:

1. Robert Madigan, petitioner, filed a petition for vaccine compensation under the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program, 42 U.S.C. §§ 300aa-10 to -34 (the “Vaccine Program”). The petition seeks compensation for injuries allegedly related to petitioner’s receipt of an influenza (“flu”) vaccine, which vaccine is contained in the Vaccine Injury Table (the “Table”), 42 C.F.R. § 100.3 (a).
2. Petitioner received his flu vaccination on December 9, 2011.
3. The vaccination was administered within the United States.
4. On June 25, 2021, the Special Master issued a Ruling on Entitlement, concluding that petitioner is entitled to compensation for a vaccine-related injury, specifically sudden sensorineural hearing loss. Respondent continues to maintain his contrary position, but will not seek review of the Special Master's determination of entitlement upon its memorialization as a reviewable decision.
5. Petitioner represents that there has been no prior award or settlement of a civil action

for damages on his behalf as a result of his condition.

6. The parties now agree that the issues between them shall be settled and that a decision should be entered awarding the compensation described in paragraph 7 of this Stipulation.

7. As soon as practicable after an entry of judgment reflecting a decision consistent with the terms of this Stipulation, and after petitioner has filed an election to receive compensation pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-21(a)(1), the Secretary of Health and Human Services will issue the following vaccine compensation payment:

A lump sum of \$635,545.39 in the form of a check payable to petitioner. This amount represents compensation for all damages that are available under 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(a).

8. As soon as practicable after the entry of judgment on entitlement in this case, and after petitioner has filed both a proper and timely election to receive compensation pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-21(a)(1), and an application, the parties will submit to further proceedings before the special master to award reasonable attorneys' fees and costs incurred in proceeding upon this petition.

9. Petitioner and his attorney represent that they have identified to respondent all known sources of payment for items or services for which the Program is not primarily liable under 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(g), including State compensation programs, insurance policies, Federal or State health benefits programs (other than Title XIX of the Social Security Act (42 U.S.C. § 1396 et seq.)), or entities that provide health services on a pre-paid basis.

10. Payment made pursuant to paragraph 7 and any amounts awarded pursuant to paragraph 8 of this Stipulation will be made in accordance with 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(i), subject to the availability of sufficient statutory funds.

11. The parties and their attorneys further agree and stipulate that, except for any award for attorneys' fees and litigation costs, and past unreimbursable expenses, the money provided



pursuant to this Stipulation will be used solely for petitioner's benefit as contemplated by a strict construction of 42 U.S.C. §§ 300aa-15(a) and (d), and subject to the conditions of 42 U.S.C. §§ 300aa-15(g) and (h).

12. In return for the payments described in paragraphs 7 and 8, petitioner, in his individual capacity, and on behalf of his heirs, executors, administrators, successors or assigns, does forever irrevocably and unconditionally release, acquit and discharge the United States and the Secretary of Health and Human Services from any and all actions or causes of action (including agreements, judgments, claims, damages, loss of services, expenses and all demands of whatever kind or nature) that have been brought, could have been brought, or could be timely brought in the Court of Federal Claims, under the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program, 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-10 et seq., on account of, or in any way growing out of, any and all known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected personal injuries to or death of petitioner resulting from, or alleged to have resulted from, the flu vaccination administered on December 9, 2011, as alleged by petitioner in a petition for vaccine compensation filed on or about December 10, 2014, in the United States Court of Federal Claims as petition No. 14-1187V.

13. If petitioner should die prior to entry of judgment, this agreement shall be voidable upon proper notice to the Court on behalf of either or both of the parties.

14. If the special master fails to issue a decision in complete conformity with the terms of this Stipulation or if the Court of Federal Claims fails to enter judgment in conformity with a decision that is in complete conformity with the terms of this Stipulation, then the parties' settlement and this Stipulation shall be voidable at the sole discretion of either party.

15. This Stipulation expresses a full and complete negotiated settlement of liability and damages claimed under the National Childhood Vaccine Injury Act of 1986, as amended, except

as otherwise noted in paragraph 8 above. There is absolutely no agreement on the part of the parties hereto to make any payment or to do any act or thing other than is herein expressly stated and clearly agreed to. The parties further agree and understand that the award described in this Stipulation may reflect a compromise of the parties' respective positions as to liability and/or amount of damages, and further, that a change in the nature of the injury or condition or in the items of compensation sought, is not grounds to modify or revise this agreement.

16. This Stipulation shall not be construed as an admission by the United States or the Secretary of Health and Human Services that the flu vaccine caused petitioner's alleged sudden sensorineural hearing loss in his left ear or any other injury or his current condition.

17. All rights and obligations of petitioner hereunder shall apply equally to petitioner's heirs, executors, administrators, successors, and/or assigns.

**END OF STIPULATION**

/

/

/

/

/

/

/

/

/

/

/

/

/

/

/


Respectfully submitted,

**PETITIONER:**




  
ROBERT MADIGAN

**ATTORNEY OF RECORD FOR  
PETITIONER:**

  
ANDREW D. DOWNING, ESQ.  
Downing Allison Jorgenson  
3030 N. Central Ave., Suite 507  
Phoenix, Arizona 85012  
Tel: (480) 701-0999  
adowning@daj-law.com

**AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE  
OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL:**

  
HEATHER L. PEARLMAN  
Deputy Director  
Torts Branch  
Civil Division  
U.S. Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 146  
Benjamin Franklin Station  
Washington, DC 20044-0146

**AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE  
OF THE SECRETARY OF HEALTH  
AND HUMAN SERVICES:**


George R.  
Grimes -S14

Digitally signed by George R.  
Grimes -S14  
Date: 2022.11.17 12:33:29 -05'00'

CDR GEORGE REED GRIMES, MD, MPH  
Director, Division of Injury  
Compensation Programs  
Health Systems Bureau  
Health Resources and Services  
Administration  
U.S. Department of Health  
and Human Services  
5600 Fishers Lane, 08N146B  
Rockville, MD 20857

Dated: 12/5/22

**ATTORNEY OF RECORD FOR  
RESPONDENT:**

  
CHRISTINE M. BECER, ESQ.  
Trial Attorney  
Torts Branch  
Civil Division  
U.S. Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 146  
Benjamin Franklin Station  
Washington, DC 20044-0146  
Tel: (202) 616-3665  
Christine.m.becer@usdoj.gov